



Patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies

Kerry Jane Peek

M Clin Sci, BSc (Hons) Physiotherapy, PG Cert Sports Physiotherapy

C3212809

Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

(Behavioural Science in relation to Medicine)

**School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Newcastle**

Submitted 19th May 2017

THESIS

Declarations

Statement of originality

I hereby certify that to the best of my knowledge and belief this thesis is my own work and contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due references and acknowledgements are made. It contains no material which has been previously submitted by me for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution.

Thesis by Publication

I hereby certify that this thesis is in the form of a series of *papers. I have included as part of the thesis a written statement from each co-author, endorsed in writing by the Faculty Assistant Dean (Research Training), attesting to my contribution to any jointly authored papers. (*Refer to clause 39.2 of the Rules Governing Research Higher Degrees for acceptable papers).

Copyright permissions

I certify that I have obtained, where necessary, permission from the copyright owners to use any third party copyright material reproduced in the thesis (e.g. questionnaires, artwork and unpublished letters), or to use any of my own published work (e.g. journal articles) in which the copyright is held by another party (e.g. publisher or co-author). Please refer to the Appendices for more information.

Date: 19th May 2017

Kerry Jane Peek

Supervisors:

Associate Professor Mariko Carey, D.Psych, NHMRC TRIP Fellow, School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Newcastle.

Laureate Professor Robert Sanson-Fisher, AO, PhD, M Clin Psych, Director, Health Behaviour Research Group, School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Newcastle.

Dr Lisa Mackenzie, PhD, National Breast Cancer Foundation Postdoctoral Research Fellow, School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Newcastle.

Acknowledgements

Supervisors

Neither this thesis nor the published papers wrote themselves. Without the tireless efforts of my three amazing supervisors, Mariko Carey, Lisa Mackenzie and Robert Sanson-Fisher this body of work would still be just an idea. I sincerely thank them for their time, energy, passion for research and their constructive and thoughtful feedback.

Funding

Thank you to the University of Newcastle for funding my PhD scholarship; the Priority Research Centre for Health Behaviour (University of Newcastle) for funding assistance to conduct the research reported in Paper Five; and the Australian Government Research Training Program Scholarship for funding assistance to conduct this PhD research.

Group

Thank you to all the researchers in the Health Behaviour Research Group and especially the PhD group for your assistance, advice and providing a walk up and down the stairs when needed (Natalie Dodd)!

Family

Last but by no means least, thank you to my wonderful husband Brendan, and my beautiful sons Harry and Charlie. Forever inspiring me to become the best person that I can.

CONTENTS

Declarations.....	ii
Supervisors	iv
Acknowledgements.....	v
CONTENTS.....	vi
List of Papers.....	x
Conference Presentations.....	xii
List of Tables.....	xiii
List of Figures	xv
List of Appendices.....	xvi
Abstract.....	xviii
Overview.....	xix
INTRODUCTION	1
REFERENCES	22
PAPER 1.....	29
Abstract.....	32
Introduction	33
Methods	35
Results	38
Discussion	43
Conclusion	47
References.....	49
PAPER 2.....	52

Abstract	55
Background	56
Methods	57
Results	60
Discussion	68
Conclusion	70
References.....	73
PAPER 3	77
Abstract	80
Introduction.....	81
Method	82
Results	86
Discussion	89
Conclusion	92
Clinical Messages.....	93
References.....	94
PAPER 4	97
Abstract	101
Introduction.....	102
Review Aims.....	103
Methods.....	103
Information Sources and Search Strategy.....	104
Data Extraction.....	105
Methodological Quality Assessment.....	106

Results	107
Discussion	112
Conclusion	115
Key Points.....	115
References.....	117
PAPER 5	120
Abstract	123
Introduction.....	124
Methods.....	126
Results.....	130
Discussion.....	134
Conclusion.....	136
Highlights.....	137
References	138
PAPER 6.....	141
Abstract	144
Background	145
Method	146
Information Sources and Search Strategy.....	147
Methodological Quality Assessment.....	147
Results	148
Discussion	159
Conclusions.....	162
References	163

PAPER 7.....	167
Abstract	170
Introduction	171
Behavioural Model.....	173
Discussion	181
Conclusion.....	182
References.....	183
DISCUSSION.....	187
Thesis Overview.....	188
Summary of Main Findings.....	190
Strengths and limitations of Thesis	197
Clinical Implications.....	203
Recommendations for Future Research	202
Conclusions.....	206
References.....	212

List of papers included as part of this thesis

Paper 1

Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. "An observational paper of Australian private practice physiotherapy consultations to explore the prescription of self-management strategies." *Musculoskeletal Care*. (2017)

<https://doi.org/10.1002/msc.1181>

Paper 2

Peek, K., Carey, M., Sanson-Fisher, R. & Mackenzie, L. "Physiotherapists' perceptions of patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies: A national survey." *Disability and Rehabilitation* (2016)

<https://doi.org/10.1080/09638288.2016.1212281>

Paper 3

Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. "Predictors of high levels of patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies" (submitted- Physiotherapy)

Paper 4

Peek, K, Sanson-Fisher, R, Mackenzie, L. & Carey, M. "Patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies: A critical review"; *International Journal of Therapy and Rehabilitation*. 22.11 (2015) 535-543.

<https://doi.org/10.12968/ijtr.2015.22.11.535>

Paper 5

Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. Patient adherence to an exercise program for chronic low back pain measured by patient-report, physical therapist perception and observational data (submitted- Physiotherapy Theory and Practice).

Paper 6

Peek K., Sanson-Fisher R., Mackenzie L., & Carey, M. Interventions to aid patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies: A systematic review. *Physiotherapy*. (2016); 102(2):127-35.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physio.2015.10.003>

Paper 7

Peek, K., Carey, M., Sanson-Fisher, R. & Mackenzie, L. "Aiding patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies: An evidence-based behavioural model in practice." *Physical Therapy Reviews* 21.2 (2016): 124-130.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10833196.2016.1226537>

Conference Presentations

Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. "Predictors of high levels of patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies." Oral presentation, Australian Physiotherapy Association Conference, Sydney 2017.

Peek, K., Carey, M., Sanson-Fisher, R. & Mackenzie, L. "Aiding patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies: An evidence-based behavioural model in practice." Oral presentation, World Conference in Public Health, Melbourne 2017.

Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. "Barriers and enablers affecting patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies." Oral presentation, World Conference in Public Health, Melbourne 2017.

Peek, K., Carey, M., Sanson-Fisher, R. & Mackenzie, L. "Patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies." Three Minute Thesis oral presentation, University of Newcastle 2016.

Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. "Barriers and enablers affecting patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies." Poster presentation, International Congress of Behavioural Medicine, Melbourne 2016.

Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. "An observational paper of Australian private practice physiotherapy consultations to explore the prescription of self-management strategies." Oral presentation, National Primary Healthcare Conference, Melbourne 2016.

Peek, K., Sanson-Fisher, R., Mackenzie, L., & Carey, M. "Interventions to aid patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies: A systematic review." Oral presentation, Australian Physiotherapy Association Research Symposium, Canberra 2015.

List of Tables

<i>Table 1.1: Sociodemographic and injury characteristics of patient participants</i>	<i>39</i>
<i>Table 1.2: Time spent on self-management strategies; number of prescribed self-management strategies; and time spent per self-management strategy (by injury location and overall).....</i>	<i>42</i>
<i>Table 2.1: Comparison of socio-demographic characteristics of physiotherapist survey sample to Australian physiotherapy workforce datasets</i>	<i>62</i>
<i>Table 2.2: Frequency and percentage of physiotherapists who agree or strongly agree that treatment outcomes can be positively impacted by patient adherence to a range of physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies.....</i>	<i>64</i>
<i>Table 2.3: Physiotherapists' (n = 298) perceptions of the most important characteristic determining patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies; listed by first rank frequency and percentage; and overall mean rank of importance out of 5.....</i>	<i>65</i>
<i>Table 2.4: Physiotherapists' perceptions (n=298) of the most important method for aiding patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies; listed by first rank frequency and percentage; and overall mean rank of importance out of 8.....</i>	<i>66</i>
<i>Table 3.1: Physiotherapist (n=14) socio-demographic characteristics compared with Health Workforce Statistics.....</i>	<i>87</i>
<i>Table 3.2: Patient participant socio-demographic characteristics (n=113).....</i>	<i>88</i>
<i>Table 4.1: Results on the reported accuracy of the measures of patient adherence used in the included non-intervention and intervention based studies.....</i>	<i>110</i>
<i>Table 5.1: Physiotherapist participant characteristics compared with Australian national workforce statistics.....</i>	<i>131</i>
<i>Table 5.2: Therapy service characteristics and data source (n=61).....</i>	<i>132</i>
<i>Table 5.3: Comparison of physiotherapist-perceived and patient self-reported level of adherence to prescribed exercise program (n=61).....</i>	<i>133</i>

<i>Table 6.1: Results of methodological quality assessment using PEDro scale.....</i>	<i>150</i>
<i>Table 6.2: Results of data extraction from the included studies.....</i>	<i>153</i>
<i>Table 7.1 Summary of the steps involved in the uCAN behavioural model</i>	<i>180</i>

List of Figures

<i>Figure 1.1: Number of patients prescribed each type of self-management strategy.....</i>	<i>40</i>
<i>Figure 4.1: The number and type of studies published over the last 20 years over four time periods (1995-2014)</i>	<i>108</i>
<i>Figure 4.2: The types of adherence measure used in the non-intervention and intervention based studies (n=53).....</i>	<i>109</i>
<i>Figure 6.1: Flow chart of the literature search.....</i>	<i>149</i>
<i>Figure 7.1: Cycle of Adherence Nudging (uCAN) behavioural model to aid patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies.....</i>	<i>173</i>

List of Appendices (Vol. II of Thesis)

Page numbers refer to Volume II- Appendices

Appendix 1: Paper One	5
Appendix 1.1: Published Paper	6
Appendix 1.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement	14
Appendix 1.3: Data Collection Sheet	20
Appendix 2: Paper Two	23
Appendix 2.1: Published Paper	24
Appendix 2.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement	31
Appendix 2.3: Survey Instrument	32
Appendix 3: Paper Three	39
Appendix 3.1: Coding Instructions for Completing the Data Collection Sheet	40
Appendix 3.2: Univariate Analysis	41
Appendix 4: Paper Four	43
Appendix 4.1: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement	44
Appendix 4.2: Flow Chart of the Literature Search	45
Appendix 4.3: Included Studies	46
Appendix 5: Paper Five	55
Appendix 6: Paper Six	56
Appendix 6.1: Published Paper	57
Appendix 6.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement	66
Appendix 6.3: Example of Search Strategy	74
Appendix 7: Paper Seven	75
Appendix 7.1: Published Paper	76
Appendix 7.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement	83
Appendix 8: Statement of Contributions from Co-authors	84
Appendix 8.1: Associate Professor Mariko Carey	85
Appendix 8.2: Laureate Robert Sanson-Fisher	87
Appendix 8.3: Dr Lisa Mackenzie	89
Appendix 9: Additional Information	91
Appendix 9.1: Conference Listings/Abstracts	92
Appendix 9.2: Poster Listings	95
Appendix 10: Study Ethics Approvals	96
Appendix 10.1: Human Research Ethics Committee Approvals	97

Appendix 10.2: Local Safety Assessments	110
Appendix 10.3: Examples of Participants Information Statements and Consent	126

Abstract

Self-management strategies including exercise and advice are important components of physiotherapy treatment plans. However, a paucity of research currently exists regarding the prescription of self-management strategies in physiotherapy private practice in Australia. Further, it is widely accepted that the effectiveness of self-management strategies is dependent upon patient adherence. This is an important area to address because evidence suggests that levels of patient adherence to self-management strategies is currently sub-optimal. However, if physiotherapists do not perceive patient adherence to be an issue then methods to aid adherence may not be readily incorporated into routine practice. In addition, there is little consensus in the literature on the characteristics which might be associated with high levels of adherence to prescribed self-management strategies, the types of interventions that can be utilised in physiotherapy to aid patient adherence and how adherence can be accurately measured.

This thesis includes seven papers which aimed to address these gaps in the literature by exploring: physiotherapist prescription of self-management strategies in private practice; the perceptions of practising physiotherapists; the levels and characteristics associated with patient-reported adherence; the methods used to measure adherence; and interventions to aid adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies. A behavioural model to aid patient adherence is also presented.

The results of this thesis support that self-management strategies are an integral component of private physiotherapy practice. However, the levels of patient adherence to all physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies in private practice are low. Patient adherence may be aided by the use of supplementary written information, asking the patient to repeat the self-management instructions and the use of activity monitors. Finally, there is a need to develop a multi-faceted measure of patient adherence to all self-management strategies which accurately captures all the elements of adherence.